

Evoking Students' Curiosity and Complicating Their Historical Thinking through Manageable, Engaging Confusion

John H. Bickford III and Molly Sigler Bickford

Eastern Illinois University and Unity Junior High School (Tolono, IL)

STATE AND NATIONAL educational initiatives have increased expectations for students' historical thinking and civic involvement.¹ Guidance for relevant, purposeful classroom experiences with age appropriate, rigorous content has never been clearer,² yet teachers still feel unprepared.³ Towards these ends, we direct attention to the antecedent of discovery: confusion. Confusion sparks the motivation to explore and solve mysteries. Manageable, engaging mysteries provide students the space and incentive to explore for answers they know are discoverable. Teachers can position students to identify the enigma as they scrutinize the documents; educators should recognize, and ease, students' emergent frustration with clues. Using Lev Vygotsky's *zone of proximal development* as a guide,⁴ educators should provide students suitable levels of challenge and support.

We view a social studies unit as a metaphorical puzzle, with age-appropriate primary and secondary sources as the pieces necessary for assembly. Teachers should not provide *all* the pieces, just a large enough portion to induce students' interest and inquiry. Like a historical detective, the child searches for clues using prior

knowledge and new understandings generated from simple scrutiny; this forms the puzzle's respective borders and corner-pieces. During the quest, the teacher guides students to use the proper investigative tools with new content from diverse and divergent perspectives; this is akin to a child grouping puzzle pieces with similar colors or comparable images. The absence of a portion of the puzzle provokes students to consider the location—and the images on the surfaces—of the missing pieces, much like a historian who has only the response letter but not the initial letter that compelled the response. Intentional curricular planning positions students to consider a mystery's many possible explanations, instead of simply searching for *the right answer*. Students, in doing so, can progress through all critical thinking tiers using every heuristic within historical thinking. To model this approach, we selected a frequently taught, partially grasped, and often misunderstood era in American history.

History and Pedagogy

The story of the Civil Rights Movement (hereafter, CRM) must begin within the shackles of slavery and include the reactionary terror of Reconstruction in order for students to grasp segregation's origin and dominion.⁵ African Americans were not simply victims, but also advocates for their own fair treatment; white allies were anomalous, as most supported the state-sponsored initiation and maintenance of social segregation, economic subjugation, and political disenfranchisement.⁶ The story must include multiple paths, diverse goals, eclectic people, and a serendipitous sequence of events. Labor, religious, and social organizations all cut distinct paths up the same mountain.⁷ They each advocated for equity in economic opportunity, political enfranchisement, social equality, or some combination.⁸ Exceptional, anonymous participants both propelled and followed famous leaders who used both planned and unplanned events to resist white Americans' social, economic, political, and legal reactionary forces.⁹ The CRM was a lengthy sequence of interrelated events over a period of centuries—not decades—inflamed by revolutionary action and submerged by reactionary response.¹⁰ It was as much about equitable university admittance, access to jobs, and avoiding being lynched as it was about separate drinking fountains and a seat on a bus.¹¹

Popular consciousness, however, begins the story with Rosa Parks's arrest and culminates with Dr. King's *I Have a Dream* speech.¹² This partial tale is an ideal place to initiate young students' considerations of the "simultaneity of continuity and change," key elements of history.¹³ Students can be positioned to interrogate primary sources that illustrate the manifest tensions between white America's mandate for, or maintenance of, continuity and black America's desires and demands for change.¹⁴ Discipline-specific scaffolding and age-appropriate curricular resources are needed to facilitate students' historical thinking.¹⁵

Introduction: Eliciting Prior Knowledge and Curiosity Using Secondary Sources

Elementary social studies curricula often include the CRM, yet overwhelmingly focus on famous figures like Rosa Parks and Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr.¹⁶ Students' schema will likely be scattered and centered on Parks and King. The CRM, then, is an ideal era to evoke curiosity through confusion. We started the story with Parks precisely because her act of defiance is well known, partially grasped, and poorly contextualized. Far from a weary seamstress, Parks was a veteran of the movement, trained in civil disobedience. Far from the *origin* of the CRM, Parks's arrest—the catalyst for a yearlong bus boycott and court case—was but one of many steps in a long, epic journey;¹⁷ it was a galvanizing event in the tension between continuity and change.¹⁸

Trade books are a quality introductory curricular resource. We selected trade books of diverse reading levels with disparate degrees of historicity to differentiate the curriculum and provide misrepresentative material for students to interrogate during close readings (see **Appendix A**, entitled *Trade Books with Varying Degrees of Historicity*).¹⁹ The class collectively read the entire list as each child was given two books and told that one was at an appropriate level of challenge while the other was far below their reading level. In doing so, the academic caste system was subverted, as differentiation was obscured behind the veil of below grade-level readings. Students felt comfortable when tasked with answering the few simple questions that guided their reading and compelled their

consideration of the content included and omitted (see **Appendix B**, *Content Analysis Questionnaire*). Students then took part in two different literacy circles based on their prescribed books. The modest trade books elicited students' prior knowledge, the content analysis tool ensured a close reading, and students worked at an individualized, age-appropriate pace.²⁰ The literacy circles guaranteed students' grasp of each book's content and enabled them to see key differences. The content analysis task evoked students' curiosities, which were seen within queries about unfamiliar names, events, and concepts. Many students asked why they were absent from the narratives if they were historically significant. Small-group and whole-class discussions emboldened students' recognition that the puzzle lacked some important pieces—the picture was only partially complete. The readings and discussions, accomplished over a period of days, elicited students' prior knowledge, curiosities, and questions. Manageable and engaging confusion, in our experience, generates genuine interest in examining new puzzle pieces to finish the puzzle, to solve the mystery.

Interpretation: Complicating Understandings with Primary Sources

Students listened intently when told that history trade books are like a non-witness's evaluation of a recess conflict. The non-witness would form a (secondary) conclusion only after examining the obtainable (primary) evidence, like witness testimonies, observable injuries, and alleged perpetrators' past misbehaviors. Each trade book's author similarly reviewed different primary sources to assemble a narrative. But what if the author had not considered, or was not given, certain exculpatory primary evidence? Or, what if the author was the parent of an alleged perpetrator? Student participants, student observers, recess monitors, and an outsider can have different conclusions about the same conflict. The anecdote clarified to students that non-witness's (secondary) conclusions could be as limited as a witness's (primary) testimony. The anecdote also facilitated students' realization that they had reviewed secondary, but no primary, sources.

Following the analogy, we then provided students primary sources to interpret, to more fully complete the puzzle. Analysis of primary

source material complicates and refines their understandings, just as identification of new puzzle pieces induces both examination for understanding and consideration of placement.²¹ Young children, unless taught otherwise, read sources for comprehension and fail to grasp nuances.²² Students must be guided to scrutinize primary sources for their source, context, representation, and intended audience, among other things. Historical documents, however, are written by and intended for adults; they can and should be modified for length, syntax, and prose to ensure age-appropriateness.²³ *Digital Repositories of Primary Sources (Appendix C)* provides ancillary primary source material to compel interpretation and refine student understandings.

We carefully selected documents that represented the CRM as a long, slow march, and not the concise period illustrated by Mrs. Parks's bus seat and Dr. King's dream. Students analyzed slave sale advertisements to see the indefinite separation of families. Photographs of whips, and the marks they left, compelled students to grasp the brutality of punishment. Oral histories from former slaves revealed that freedom spawned insecurity and reactionary violence. Newspaper articles from disparate states separated by decades revealed the ruthless frequency of lynching well into the twentieth century. Diverse sources told nuanced stories of Mrs. Parks's arrest, the subsequent boycott, reactionary arrests and threats of violence, and, finally, Supreme Court vindication. These historical documents, both given and revisited over a period of days, enabled students to answer their own questions about names or groups that popped up unexpectedly with only modest explanation within the trade book narratives. In doing so, students could more adequately contextualize people like A. Philip Randolph, Claudette Colvin, Emmett Till, Jo Ann Robinson, "Bull" Connor, the Women's Political Council, and the (white) Citizens' Council.

Students analyzed primary sources for five days, with new and different documents being added daily. Each day, students engaged in individual interpretation, small-group work, and large-group discussions to ensure that the vast array of documents—and the corresponding confusion—did not overwhelm. Reliable close reading strategies, like *Question the Author*, supported individual students' analyses of the documents' source, context, and perspective.²⁴ Various grouping methods, like *Think/Pair/Share* and *Give One/*

Get One, facilitated students' dialogue, completion of notes, and collective work. Graphic organizers—initiated individually and completed in small groups—targeted specific historical thinking patterns, like source, context, perspective, and corroboration, or positioned students to consider the historical contributions of specific individuals or groups (see **Appendix D**, *Graphic Organizers to Facilitate Historical Analysis*). Daily large-group discussions provided a measure of students' collective confusion and an opportunity to ease any emergent anxiety by satisfactorily addressing previously unanswered questions; the discourse assured command of the intricacies of specific documents and overarching patterns between documents; the dialogue provided space for previews of upcoming primary sources, which sparked new questions.

Students' interest and analyses were likely as much a response to the confusing primary source material as they were to the reliable methods. Confusion evoked engagement and compelled interpretation. Engagement and interpretation, however, are only a means to the far more complex, important end. Synthesis, evaluation, and creation are top three tiers in the pyramid of criticality.²⁵

Synthesis: Visually Organizing Understandings within Timelines

We could have easily provided students ready-made timelines to assist their grasp of the specific events' sequence.²⁶ The gift, however, would have cheated students the opportunity to grapple with the assembly and organization of timelines. Further, the process of *Timeline Construction*, an authentic assessment, provides students the space and opportunity to visually integrate and sequence primary source material they have previously interpreted. Students' understandings of the content are sharpened when they are asked to return to, and reconsider, previously generated understandings in order to assemble a sequential arrangement. Students relied on notes developed from the preceding days' primary sources, which were affixed to bulletin boards and walls as reminders.²⁷ Students' historical thinking and newly generated understandings were visible within such text-based writing.²⁸ Final products for timelines varied. Some students focused entirely on Rosa Parks's life, contributions, and impact; these demonstrated depth of involvement. Other

students' timelines centered solely on the Civil Rights Movement within the 1950s and 1960s with more breadth than depth. Still others generated expansive yet shallow timelines of the eighteenth, nineteenth, and twentieth centuries that contextualized the CRM as a larger Black Freedom Movement.

Any of the three approaches could potentially meet our principled goals of the timeline activity, which was students' synthesis of diverse sources to historically sequence germane events. The diversity in scope generated both simplistic questions (e.g., "So, which one is better?") and more inspective queries (e.g., "Why didn't you include Rosa's background with the NAACP?"). Students' clearly wanted to share and see others' timelines; they readily identified the primary and secondary material that other students' timelines relied upon. Class discussions enabled students to share judgments on the appropriate degree of scope and the suitable use of sources while responding to others' differing opinions.²⁹ Timelines are an ideal *method* to facilitate collective interrogation of individual students' historical integration of diverse sources.

As an *assessment*, however, timelines fell short. Students' syntheses of multiple sources were apparent within the timelines; their historical understandings of the sources were not. A teacher could more effectively assess students' historical understandings of individual sources using the graphic organizers mentioned above (and included in **Appendix D**) than from the timelines. This is partly due to space constraints and perhaps to students' interest in visual appeal, but more so to important elements of an effective timeline: clarity and brevity are necessary, yet complexity of thought overly complicates the timeline. Timeline construction is a quality method, but not an ideal assessment of students' historical thinking; the subsequent activity is an unquestionably effective method and assessment of students' historical thinking.

Evaluation:

Scrutinizing a Secondary Source for Use of Primary Sources

Students regularly view and assess other students' work. Peer grading is common in math, and students frequently peer review in English/language arts. Considering another person's thought process through evaluation of their work strengthens understandings.³⁰ Such

evaluation cannot be accomplished without application of one's own prior knowledge.³¹ In previous activities, students scrutinized a trade book for its historical *misrepresentations* (using **Appendix B**); here, we selected Nikki Giovanni's *Rosa* (2005) for its depth and historicity.³² Giovanni's *Rosa* provided students the opportunity to evaluate the primary source material that (possibly) informed—and was (potentially) integrated within—her historical narrative (see **Appendix E**, *Scrutinizing a Secondary Trade Book for Primary Sources Usage*). The trade book, for instance, stated:

Rosa waved good-bye and headed for the bus stop. She fiddled in her pocket for the dime so that she would not have to ask for change. When she stepped up to drop her fare in, she was smiling in anticipation of the nice dinner she would make. As was the evil custom, she then got off the bus and went to the back door to enter the bus from the rear. Rosa saw that the section reserved for blacks was full, but she noticed the neutral section, the part of the bus where blacks or whites could sit, had free seats.³³

Given the primary source material that Lynn (pseudonym) had previously examined, the length and depth of her written response was not surprising:

Says it was 'evil' for Af. Am. [sic] to pay up front, get out, and get on in back was probably from doc #1 but book doesn't mention how bus drivers would just leave after Af. Am. payed [sic].

Lynn speculated the origins of Giovanni's understandings when she explicitly referenced the first primary document, Jo Ann Robinson's May 21, 1954 letter to the Montgomery Alabama City Council on behalf of the Women's Political Council. In it, Robinson noted the frequency of bus drivers' intentional departure after African Americans had paid, but before they could enter the rear of the bus. Lynn rightly pointed out that Giovanni's reference to this "evil custom" was significantly minimized and did not include what amounts to the bus driver's theft of paid fares. Lynn went on to note:

Says she was in neutral section but doc #2 [sic] says "white section" but doc #2 [sic] was [written] by the cops so they could be lying or maybe they called it "white section" because white people wanted it and doc #5 [sic] says middle section is open until whites need the spaces so maybe thats [sic] why police report says "white section" or maybe cops were white and racist because this is Alabama in 1955.

Many observations can be made about Lynn's scrutiny of Giovanni's *Rosa*. First, Lynn connected Giovanni's prose to multiple primary sources, specifically the police report of Rosa Parks's arrest and the Montgomery City Code for the bus system. She noted the incongruity between the trade book's narrative (which noted a neutral section) and the text of the police report (which noted a white section). Lynn considered the origin of the divergence. She first speculated that the police could be lying, then considered the officers' interpretation of the wording of the Montgomery City Code, and finally posited the police officers' (potential) bias. Lynn's writing indicates application, interpretation, and evaluation, when applied to Bloom's taxonomy;³⁴ her writing signifies sourcing, corroboration, and contextualization, when considered from a history pedagogy framework.³⁵ Lynn's writing was selected because it was an illustrative example of typical student responses to the task of scrutinizing a trade book's use of primary documents. She did not write the most, nor did she write the least. Most students' ably interpreted the author's use of primary source material.

Confusion emerged when students could not promptly discern the primary source origin of specific statements within the secondary source. One student aptly characterized the confusion as akin to looking at a number and being asked which operation and possible numbers contributed to that answer. "It could be anything, right?" Actually, no, it could not. It might be more than one primary source, but it could not be *anything*. Confusion, as before, is a powerful stimulant of cognition so long as it does not overwhelm. Inspecting a trade book for its (likely) use of primary source material was novel.³⁶ It enabled students to interrogate secondary sources and consider how they are dependent upon the historian's assembly of understandings generated from interpretation of primary source material.³⁷ In doing so, students considered the previously analyzed primary sources in new ways as they applied their understandings to a novel cognitive task.

Creation: Critically Demonstrating Newly Generated Understandings

Students' efforts until this point centered on analysis, synthesis, and evaluation of diverse, rich primary sources and engaging

secondary trade books. The culminating task targeted creative expressions of newly generated understandings, the highest level of critical thinking.³⁸ Large-class discussions considered the importance but unreliability of oral histories; first-person accounts are captivating, yet are usually recorded months, years, or decades after the event. To target the third Common Core writing standard (W.6.3), students wrote a first-person oral history of a historical figure—real or imagined—detailing their involvement in and perceptions of the CRM. *Fictionalized Oral Histories* (**Appendix F**) has samples of students' writing.

The samples within *Fictionalized Oral Histories* were purposefully selected for their reliance on historical events, the precision of language, and demonstrable voice. Students' selections were diverse, as is noted in the samples of students' writing, which were intentionally included because of the juxtaposition from Rosa Parks and James Blake, the bus driver. Through peer revision and teacher prompts, their writing addressed every element of the third writing standard:

- a. Engage and orient the reader by establishing a context and introducing a narrator and/or characters; organize an event sequence that unfolds naturally and logically.
- b. Use narrative techniques, such as dialogue, pacing, and description, to develop experiences, events, and/or characters.
- c. Use a variety of transition words, phrases, and clauses to convey sequence and signal shifts from one time frame or setting to another.
- d. Use precise words and phrases, relevant descriptive details, and sensory language to convey experiences and events.
- e. Provide a conclusion that follows from the narrated experiences or events.³⁹

Discussion

Novice teachers seek the perfect method to supplement the flawless assessment, or at least we did when we were inexperienced. As veterans, we know evocative primary sources are as essential as discipline-specific, age-appropriate pedagogy. The historical documents, however, should be organized in such a way as to

compel students' confusion—a robust catalyst for learning—and position their interrogation of diverse and divergent sources. This is why students were first tasked with analyzing secondary texts with historically misrepresentative narratives and then given new primary sources daily that only partially completed the figurative puzzle. The misrepresentative narratives evoked their prior knowledge but identified gaps—and generated questions—that the historical documents (incompletely) addressed. Confusion, when properly organized, generates interest, attention, and questions so long as it does not overwhelm. Like fire that can either heat or burn a house, teachers should position students to confront confusion while frequently assessing their anxiety. Evocative historical documents are best; they are bolstered with complementary pedagogy, like the methods and graphic organizers mentioned, that assisted students as they interrogated the primary sources and grappled with the confusion.

The pedagogy should be organized in such a way that students first interpret primary sources and then reconsider their interpretations, generate historical understandings, and refine them. This is illustrated when one considers the important similarities—and key distinctions—between **Appendix B** and **Appendix E** as well between the two graphic organizers in **Appendix D**. Both **Appendix B** and **Appendix E** compel close readings and reading the silences, but the former targets historical misrepresentations in secondary texts while the latter positions students to consider the primary sources upon which the secondary narratives relied. Both graphic organizers within **Appendix D** facilitate students' interpretation of primary sources to discern their historical significance, but the former elicits questions of source and perspective and the latter evokes considerations of corroboration and context. The pedagogy, thus, guides students' use of heuristics, the cognitive patterns of necessary for historical thinking.⁴⁰

Historical understandings are figurative three-dimensional edifices under constant construction; they are not assembled linearly nor quickly. Students' constructions of historical understandings are aided when the material is interwoven, and not simply connected. In the above content and activities, the reader will note literary and informational texts, primary and secondary sources, historical reading and historical writing, and critical thinking and historical thinking.

Interested teachers could initiate similar curricula with Dr. King’s “I Have a Dream” speech as the origin. Research findings indicate the disparate historicity within trade books about Dr. King.⁴¹ A recent edition of *Cobblestone: Discover American History* pursued elementary students and teachers in an issue entitled “Unsung Heroes of the Civil Rights Movement”;⁴² it could supplement the previously suggested primary sources (**Appendix C**) in similar ways to construct a paradigm of confusion.

Notes

1. National Governors Association Center for Best Practices and Council of Chief State School Officers, *Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts and Literacy in History/Social Studies, Science, and Technical Subjects* (Washington, D.C.: National Governors Association Center for Best Practices, 2010); Partnership for Assessment of Readiness for College and Careers, *PARCC Model Content Frameworks: English Language Arts/Literacy, Grades 3–11, Version 2.0* (Washington, D.C.: Partnership for Assessment of Readiness for College and Careers, 2012).
2. National Council for the Social Studies (NCSS), *National Curriculum Standards for Social Studies: A Framework for Teaching, Learning, and Assessment* (Silver Spring, MD: Library of Congress Publications, 2010); National Council for the Social Studies, *College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) Framework for Social Studies State Standards: Guidance for Enhancing the Rigor of K–12 Civics, Economics, Geography, and History* (Silver Spring, MD: NCSS, 2013).
3. Jonathan Sapers, “Common Core’s Unintended Consequences? More Teachers Write Their Own Curricula,” *The Hechinger Report: Covering Innovation and Inequality in Education* (26 February 2015), <<http://hechingerreport.org/common-cores-unintended-consequence/>>.
4. L. S. Vygotsky, *Mind in Society: The Development of Higher Psychological Processes* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1978).
5. Ira Berlin, *Many Thousand Gone: The First Two Centuries of Slavery in North America* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1998); Douglas A. Blackmon, *Slavery by Another Name: The Re-Enslavement of Black Americans from the Civil War to World War II* (New York: Doubleday, 2008); John W. Blassingame, *Slave Testimony: Two Centuries of Letters, Speeches, Interviews, and Autobiographies* (Baton Rouge, LA: Louisiana State University Press, 1977).
6. Tera W. Hunter, *To ‘Joy My Freedom: Southern Black Women’s Lives and Labors after the Civil War* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1997); Allen C. Guelzo, *Fateful Lightning: A New History of the Civil War and*

Reconstruction (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012); Rayford W. Logan, *The Betrayal of the Negro, From Rutherford B. Hayes to Woodrow Wilson* (New York: Collier Books, 1965).

7. Jervis Anderson, *Bayard Rustin: Troubles I've Seen: A Biography* (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 1997); Daniel S. Davis, *Mr. Black Labor: The Story of A. Philip Randolph, Father of the Civil Rights Movement* (New York: E. P. Dutton & Co., 1972); William P. Jones, *The March on Washington: Jobs, Freedom, and the Forgotten History of Civil Rights* (New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 2013).

8. Cornelius L. Bynum, *A. Philip Randolph and the Struggle for Civil Rights* (Urbana, IL: University of Illinois, 2010); Michael Ezra, ed., *The Economic Civil Rights Movement: African Americans and the Struggle for Economic Power* (New York: Routledge Press, 2013); Jerald Podair, *Bayard Rustin: American Dreamer* (New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2009); Barbara Ransby, *Ella Baker and the Black Freedom Movement: A Radical Democratic Vision* (Chapel Hill, NC: The University of North Carolina Press, 2003).

9. Jones, *The March on Washington*; Manning Marable, *Malcolm X: A Life of Reinvention* (New York: Penguin Books, 2011); Ransby, *Ella Baker and the Black Freedom Movement*.

10. Blackmon, *Slavery by Another Name*; Bill Fauver and Jim Ruderman, *Stride Toward Freedom: The Aftermath of Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka* (Los Angeles, CA: National Center for History in the Schools, UCLA, 2001); Andrew E. Kersten, *A. Philip Randolph: A Life in the Vanguard* (New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2007).

11. Jones, *The March on Washington*; Jeanne Theoharis, *The Rebellious Life of Mrs. Rosa Parks* (New York: Beacon Press, 2013).

12. Herbert Kohl, "The Politics of Children's Literature: What's Wrong with the Rosa Parks Myth?" in *Rethinking Our Classrooms: Teaching for Equity and Justice, Volume I*, ed. Wayne Au, Bill Bigelow, and Stan Karp (Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2007), 168-171; James W. Loewen, *Lies My Teacher Told Me: Everything Your American History Textbook Got Wrong* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1995).

13. Peter Seixas and Tom Morton, *The Big Six Historical Thinking Concepts* (Toronto, Canada: Nelson, 2012), 81.

14. Seixas and Morton, *The Big Six Historical Thinking Concepts*.

15. John H. Bickford III, "Assessing and Addressing the Historical (Mis)Representations within Children's Literature about the Civil Rights Movement," *The History Teacher* 48, no. 4 (August 2015): 693-736; Jeffrey D. Nokes, "Recognizing and Addressing the Barriers to Adolescents' 'Reading Like Historians,'" *The History Teacher* 44, no. 3 (May 2011): 379-404; Sam Wineburg, *Historical Thinking and Other Unnatural Acts: Charting the Future of Teaching the Past* (Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press, 2001).

16. Katherine A. O'Connor, Tina Heafner, and Eric Groce, "Advocating for Social Studies: Documenting the Decline and Doing Something about It," *Social Education* 71, no. 5 (September 2005): 255; Jennifer McMurrer, *Instructional Time in Elementary Schools: A Closer Look at Changes for Specific Subjects*

(Washington, D.C.: Center on Education Policy, 2008); Deborah Menkart, Alana D. Murray, and Jenice L. View, *Putting the Movement Back into Civil Rights Teaching* (Teaching for Change, Poverty & Race Research Action Council [PRRAC], and Rethinking Schools, 2004); B. Norris and D. Brock, *Exploring History through Primary Sources: Civil Rights Movement* (Huntington Beach, CA: Teacher Created Materials, Inc, 2003); Rahima Wade, "Beyond Expanding Horizons: New Curriculum Directions for Elementary Social Studies," *The Elementary School Journal* 103, no. 2 (November 2002): 115-130.

17. Theoharis, *The Rebellious Life of Mrs. Rosa Parks*.
18. Seixas and Morton, *The Big Six Historical Thinking Concepts*.
19. Bickford, "Assessing and Addressing the Historical (Mis) Representations"; John H. Bickford III and Cynthia W. Rich, "Trade Books' Historical Representation of Eleanor Roosevelt, Rosa Parks, and Helen Keller," *Social Studies Research and Practice* 9, no. 1 (Spring 2014): 18-65.
20. Common Core Standards RH.6-8.2; RH.6-8.5.
21. Nokes, "Recognizing and Addressing the Barriers"; Wineburg, *Historical Thinking and Other Unnatural Acts*.
22. John H. Bickford III, "Initiating Historical Thinking in Elementary Schools," *Social Studies Research and Practice* 8, no. 3 (Fall 2013): 60-77; Linda S. Levstik and Keith C. Barton, *Doing History: Investigating with Children in Elementary and Middle Schools*, second ed. (Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Association Publishers, 2001); Bruce A. VanSledright, "Fifth Graders Investigating History in the Classroom: Results from a Researcher-Practitioner Design Experiment," *The Elementary School Journal* 103, no. 2 (November 2002): 131-160.
23. Bickford, "Initiating Historical Thinking"; Sam Wineburg and Daisy Martin, "Tampering with History: Adapting Primary Sources for Struggling Readers," *Social Education* 73, no. 5 (September 2009): 212-216.
24. Common Core Standards RH.6-8.1; RH.6-8.6; RH.6-8.9.
25. Lorin W. Anderson and David R. Krathwohl, eds., *A Taxonomy for Learning, Teaching, and Assessing: A Revision of Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives* (New York: Longman, 2001).
26. Sonya J. Fox and Beryl Elizabeth Exley, "Historical Timelines: Analyzing Multimodal Text Design," *Social Studies Research and Practice* 4, no. 3 (Fall 2009), 17-27.
27. Common Core Standards RH.6-8.7; RH.6-8.9.
28. Common Core Standards W.6.8; W.6.9b.
29. Common Core Standards SL.6.4; SL.6.5.
30. Bruce A. VanSledright, *Assessing Historical Thinking and Understanding: Innovative Designs for New Standards* (New York: Routledge, 2014).
31. Sam Wineburg, Mark Smith, and Joel Breakstone, "New Directions in Assessment: Using Library of Congress Sources to Assess Historical Understanding," *Social Education* 76, no. 6 (November-December 2012): 290-293.
32. Nikki Giovanni, *Rosa* (New York: Henry Holt and Company, 2005); Bickford and Rich, "Trade Books' Historical Representation."
33. Giovanni, *Rosa*, 6-7.

34. Anderson and Krathwohl, *A Taxonomy for Learning*.
35. Nokes, "Recognizing and Addressing the Barriers"; Wineburg, *Historical Thinking and Other Unnatural Acts*.
36. Common Core Standards RI.6-8.8; W.6.9b.
37. Common Core Standards RI.6-8.1; RI.6-8.9.
38. Anderson and Krathwohl, *A Taxonomy for Learning*.
39. National Governors Association Center for Best Practices & Council of Chief State School Officers, *Common Core State Standards*, 43
40. Nokes, "Recognizing and Addressing the Barriers"; Wineburg, *Historical Thinking and Other Unnatural Acts*.
41. Bickford, "Assessing and Addressing the Historical (Mis)Representations."
42. E. Arnesen, ed., "Unsung Heroes of the Civil Rights Movement," *Cobblestone: Discover American History* 35, no. 2 (February 2014).

Appendix A

Trade Books with Varying Degrees of Historicity

- Adler, D. (1993). *A Picture Book of Rosa Parks*. New York: Holiday House.
- Benjamin, A. (1996). *Young Rosa Parks: Civil Rights Heroine*. New York: Troll Communications.
- Edwards, P. (2005). *The Bus Ride that Changed History: The Story of Rosa Parks*. New York: Houghton Mifflin Company.
- Kelleher, K. (2007). *Rosa Parks: Civil Rights Pioneer*. New York: HarperCollins Publishers.
- Kittinger, J. (2010). *Rosa's Bus: The Ride to Civil Rights*. Honesdale, PA: Calkins Creek Press.
- Levine, M. (2005). *Rosa Parks*. North Mankato, MN: Compass Point Books.
- Linde, B. (2012). *Rosa Parks*. New York: Gareth Stevens Publishing.
- Mara, W. (2007). *Rosa Parks*. New York: Scholastic, Inc.

- Parks, R. and J. Haskins, (1997). *I am Rosa Parks*. London, United Kingdom: Penguin Books.
- Pingry, P. (2007). *The Story of Rosa Parks*. Nashville, TN: CandyCane Press.
- Pingry, P. (2008). *Meet Rosa Parks*. Nashville, TN: Ideals Children's Books.
- Pinkney, A. (2008). *Boycott Blues: How Rosa Parks Inspired a Nation*. New York: Greenwillow Books.
- Reynolds, A. (2010). *Back of the Bus*. New York: Philomel Books.
- Ringgold, F. (1999). *If a Bus Could Talk: The Story of Rosa Parks*. New York: Aladdin Books.
- Schaefer, L. (2002). *Rosa Parks*. Mankato, MN: Pebble Books.

Appendix B

Content Analysis Questionnaire

1. Expected age/grade of the reader:
 - a. Primary (K-2)
 - b. Intermediate (3-5)
 - c. Middle level (6-8)

2. Genre:
 - a. Historical Fiction
 - b. Non-Fiction

3. Did the book mention anything Rosa did to help African Americans before she was arrested on December 1, 1955? Explain and list the page number.
 - a. Yes
 - b. No

4. Did the book mention how segregation *started*? Explain and list the page number.
 - a. Yes (as something white Americans started and kept going)
 - b. No (it was something that “just was”)
5. When describing segregation, which elements did the book mention? Explain and list the page number.
 - a. Social Segregation (separate schools, separate drinking fountains, or separate restaurants) [Yes or No]
 - b. Political Segregation (how African Americans were not allowed to vote in many places) [Yes or No]
 - c. Economic Segregation (how African Americans could not go to the best schools to get the best jobs or were not even allowed to have certain jobs) [Yes or No]
6. When describing segregation, which events did the book mention that came *before* Rosa Parks’s arrest? Explain and list the page number.
 - a. Slavery in America [Yes or No]
 - b. Reconstruction [Yes or No]
 - c. The Supreme Court’s decision, called *Brown v. Board of Education* [Yes or No]
 - d. Emmett Till and how he was attacked [Yes or No]
 - e. Claudette Colvin and how she was arrested for doing something like Rosa did [Yes or No]
 - f. Jo Ann Robinson and all she did to help [Yes or No]
7. When describing segregation, which events did the book mention that came *after* Rosa Parks’s arrest? Explain and list the page number.
 - a. The Montgomery Bus Boycott [Yes or No]
 - b. How Rosa Parks was threatened and forced to move north because she was scared [Yes or No]
 - c. How the Civil Rights Movement grew and changed over the next few years as more people resisted America’s mistreatment of African Americans [Yes or No]

Note: Questions informed by content analysis research in John H. Bickford III, “Assessing and Addressing the Historical (Mis)Representations within Children’s Literature about the Civil Rights Movement,” *The History Teacher* 48, no. 4 (August 2015): 693-736; and John H. Bickford III and Cynthia W. Rich, “Trade Books’ Historical Representation of Eleanor Roosevelt, Rosa Parks, and Helen Keller,” *Social Studies Research and Practice* 9, no. 1 (Spring 2014): 18-65.

Appendix C

Digital Repositories of Primary Sources

A Broad Look at the African American Experience

The African-American Mosaic: A Library of Congress Resource Guide for the Study of Black History and Culture provides teachers a multi-century view and includes books, periodicals, prints, photographs, music, film, and audio recordings. <<http://www.loc.gov/exhibits/african/>>

The Public Broadcasting Service's *Explore: Black History and Culture* provides essential themes such as Ancestry, Race, & Identity; The Birmingham Campaign; Civil Rights Icons; The Civil Rights Movement; Emancipation, Reconstruction, & Jim Crow South; Enslavement & the Underground Railroad; The March on Washington; and Religion. <<http://www.pbs.org/black-culture/explore/>>

Slavery

Africans in America. The Public Broadcasting Service collection is organized into four themed sections of a timeline: the Terrible Transformation (1450-1750); Revolution (1750-1805); Brotherly Love (1791-1831); and Judgment Day (1831-1865). Each themed section includes primary documents (Resource Bank), secondary descriptions (Narrative), and supplementary ideas for lessons (Teacher's Guide). <<http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/aia/home.html>>

Atlantic Slave Trade and Slave Life in the Americas. The primary documents are almost entirely etchings, drawings, and photographs. They are organized around specific themes, which include Maps: Africa, New World, Slave Trade; Pre-Colonial Africa: Society, Polity, Culture; Capture of Slaves & Coffles in Africa; European Forts & Trading Posts in Africa; Slave Ships & the Atlantic Crossing (Middle Passage); Slave Sales & Auctions: African Coast & the Americas; New World Agriculture & Plantation Labor; Plantation Scenes, Slave Settlements & Houses; Domestic Servants & Free People of Color; Miscellaneous Occupations, & Economic Activities; Marketing & Urban Scenes; Music, Dance, & Recreational Activities; Family Life, Child Care, Schools; Religion & Mortuary Practices; Military Activities & U.S. Civil War; Physical Punishment, Rebellion, Running Away; Emancipation & Post-Slavery Life; Portraits & Illustrations of Individuals. <<http://hitchcock.itc.virginia.edu/Slavery/search.html>>

Rosa Parks and the Montgomery Bus Boycott

Historical Thinking Matters: Rosa Parks. Historical Thinking Matters has organized a collection of primary sources centered on Rosa Parks and the Montgomery Bus Boycott. Classroom strategies accompany the primary source documents. Writing prompts guide students along through the process of close reading, contextualizing, sourcing, corroboration, and other historical thinking skills. <<http://historicalthinkingmatters.org/rosaparks/>>

Teaching with Documents: An Act of Courage, The Arrest Records of Rosa Parks. The National Archives document-based inquiry includes the actual primary sources of both from Parks's arrest and subsequent court case. <<http://www.archives.gov/education/lessons/rosa-parks/>>

Bus Boycott: Historical Documents Highlight Integration Milestone. Sponsored by the *Teaching Tolerance: A Project of the Southern Poverty Law Center*, this website provides elementary teachers primary documents, corresponding classroom activities, and various free curricular materials. <<http://www.tolerance.org/activity/bus-boycott-historical-documents-highlight-integration-miles>>

Everyday Americans, Exceptional Americans: Rosa Parks. This activity is an abridged version of the activities and primary sources located on *Historical Thinking Matters*. Fewer resources, simpler questions, and more direct scaffolding enable teachers to engage younger students more efficiently with historical scrutiny of the events of 1955 and 1956. This site contextualizes segregation—and desegregation advocacy—up through the Supreme Court's finding that bus segregation was unconstitutional and the Montgomery buses were desegregated. <<http://chnm.gmu.edu/tah-loudoun/blog/psas/rosa-parks-and-the-montgomery-bus-boycott/>>

Assorted Topics from 1950s, 1960s, and 1970s

Teaching with Documents: Order of Argument in the Case, Brown v. Board of Education. The National Archives inquiry includes primary sources from this critical juncture in American history, a catalyst for further advocacy. <<http://www.archives.gov/education/lessons/brown-case-order/>>

Teaching with Documents: Court Documents Related to Martin Luther King, Jr., and Memphis Sanitation Workers. The National Archives

inquiry includes primary sources centered on King's labor and socio-economic advocacy, a historical topic rarely incorporated with young learners. **<<http://www.archives.gov/education/lessons/memphis-v-mlk/>>**

Court Documents Related to Segregation in Public Facilities and Schools. The National Archives document-based exploration focuses on the desegregation of Boston's public schools and discrimination on planes, a historical era rarely incorporated with elementary students. **<<http://www.archives.gov/education/lessons/segregation-public-facilities.html>>**

Note: All of the documents are freely available for classroom use, but teachers could modify the prose and syntax to an appropriate level of difficulty for elementary students.

Appendix D

Graphic Organizers to Facilitate Historical Analysis

Primary document. Who is its source? What do we know about this person? Be specific.	Historical significance. What did you learn from this? Why is this document important? Be specific.	Context and Connections. When was this document created? How is this document similar to or different from other documents?

Note: This graphic organizer guided students' analyses with writing prompts atop each column that targeted specific heuristics; this multi-page document had twenty rows with large spaces for students' writing.

Name of person/ organization.	What is this person's/ organization's historical significance?	Where does this person emerge in history? Which documents reference this person?

Note: This graphic organizer grounded students' synthesis and contextualization of significant historical figures (e.g., Rosa Parks, Claudette Colvin, Jo Ann Robinson, Eugene "Bull" Connor, Martin L. King, Jr., E. D. Nixon, Emmett Till) and groups (e.g., NAACP, Women's Political Council, White Citizens' Council). This multi-page document had more than two dozen rows on three separate pages.

Appendix E

Scrutinizing a Secondary Trade Book for Primary Source Usage

Page number. Which pages have sentences with historical claims?	Origin of historical claim. Which primary sources were possibly used for Giovanni to make this an evidence-based claim?

Note: The writing prompts atop this graphic organizer facilitated students' scrutiny of a secondary source, Nikki Giovanni's *Rosa* (2005); this two-column graphic organizer prepared had more than twenty rows on two pages.

Appendix F

Fictionalized Oral Histories by Students

Rosa Parks's Fictionalized Account

I was taking measurements of a “white” women, who had long beautiful shiny black hair and a small button nose and had pretty green eyes. Her name was Scarlet she was a nice women, always so polite to me, sometime we would talk about our husbands. She was a really nice women, she would ask me how was my day, have you eaten, has anybody been rude to you? Questions like that. We both laugh and giggle sometimes. On days she wasn't here, well she's barely here. The only times I get to see her is when she needs measurements, her husband needs measurements on his shoes, or for her 5 month old baby who needs cloths measurements. Those were usually 2 days a week, and always on Monday and Wednesday. We're not really friends, she's just a customer. She has to pretend to not like me in front of other people to protect her family. I was quiet most of the time, while she talked I took measurements and listen.

“Hey Rosa?” Scarlet said.

“Yes Mrs. Scarlet,” I was measuring the dress she was wearing.

“My husband and I are moving out of state to find a new home in California because I'm with child,” She says happily.

“That's great.” I was happy for her. I looked at the time it was 7:50. I've been measuring her for about two hours.

“Rosa, closing time,” Boss said.

“Ok,” I felt irritated and tired as I was closing the shop. “Bye Scarlet.”

“Bye Rosa,” Scarlet said while walking off.

I looked down at my watch 8:18 and looked back up and started walking to the bus stop. After waiting two minutes, the bus showed up and I paid. There are no open seats except for in the section where white and colored people could sit. Then while waiting for the others people to come on the bus, a white man stood by Blake, our bus driver, looking for a seat. I was sitting in the aisle seat. Blake told everyone to get up in my section so the man next to him can take our spots. Everyone got up but me. I was annoyed a tired and didn't want to give up my seat.

“Lady get up and go to the back now!” said Blake raising his voice.

“Why do you pick on us?”

“I'm going to call the police!”

“Do what you must,” as I kept quiet.

I heard mumbles about how I “should go to jail” and “she's allowed to sit there.” And a lot of other stuff. I was tired of everyone picking on us;

I was annoyed. It stinks because we're not "equal". Three minutes late the police came up.

"Ma'am are you going to move?" Nicely but sternly.

"No," softly. I stood up when he told me and looked at my watch—8:45—was when I was arrested. I walked off the bus to see Blake, a smug look on his face. Walking handcuffed in front of a police officer was not good but so was being arrested. What I thought was a simple thing turned into a big thing...

James Blake's Fictionalized Account

I never really faced consequences for my actions. I also never understood how my actions could change history. On December 1st, 1955, I made a choice that gave me a bad reputation for generations up generations to come. My name is J.F. Blake. Let me tell you about that fateful day.

It was the first day of December in Montgomery Alabama. I could already sense something different as soon as I awoke. Christmas was in the air, and it made it light and close to fragrant. I went to the kitchen, made myself some coffee, toast, and cereal. As I ate, I picked up a newspaper and frowned. The title read: "Emmett Till's Family Still Mourns". I skimmed the article and muttered to myself, "Why are they still talkin' 'bout that boy? He deserved what he had comin'!"

I soon realized that my shift at work would begin soon. So, I slipped on my uniform. As soon as I opened the door, the cold air nearly knocked me off my feet. It wasn't impeccably cold that day, just a surprise after leaving the warm and cozy house. I got into my car and drove to the bus garage. I scoured the place in search of an empty parking spot. I spotted one, drove up to it, and cut off a guy lookin' at the same spot. *Ha! This is my spot now, so tough luck*, I thought. Once I parked I walked inside, greeted the secretary, and went off to get my bus. Of course, I did *not* miss the chance to snatch up a free doughnut.

The bus was cold and the air felt stale when I stepped onto the bus. I switched on the heat and turned on the radio. Christmas music played quietly as I munched on the doughnut's glazed exterior. I patted the radio happily. I loved the nifty thing because I could play music, of any kind for that matter, whenever I wanted. I revved the engine a few time to help it to warm up faster. I shoved the rest of the doughnut into my mouth and set off towards my first stop.

I arrived at my first stop, smiling at all the people who put their shiny dimes into the bucket. *Cling, cling cling!* The noise was like music to my ears. It was like hearing my wallet fill. Then I saw a Negro man and my smile disappeared. I thought about leaving a little early, but I decided to be charitable. After I surveyed the seats to see that everyone was in their

places, I drove off. This ritual was the same year-round, but it did reap its benefits from time to time. For example, me and this man, John, I believe his name was, were becomin' good acquaintances. He actually bought me a coffee for a gift. How thoughtful! Most people don't understand how difficult my job can be sometimes.

By my sixth or seventh stop, it was around my lunchtime, so I went to a little sandwich shop. A Christmas tree stood in the window, and the place was lit up with decorations. I breathed in; it smelled amazing! But when I got in, this Negro lady behind the counter was givin' me the "evil eye" and said I can't have my coffee there.

"Well then, just bring me a bagel, lady." I snorted.

She sighed and brought me a plain bagel, still warm to the touch.

"Ya know what, make it an egg-sausage sandwich."

So, she put back the still-warm bagel and brought me the sandwich I wanted.

"I'll take the bagel too."

She huffed and grabbed me another bagel. "That'll be 78 cents, please." This one wasn't as warm though.

"78 cents? You know what? Forget it! This place is too darn expensive!" But I was real hungry so I turned around and grudgingly gave her the money then left. "Who does that negro think she is?" I mumbled to myself.

I was in a foul mood for the rest of the day. It didn't help that I had developed a headache too. Heck! Everything was a little darker and drearier. Christmas décor wasn't the same either. I left some Negros behind at the bus stop after that. I swear they all work together or something. By the twentieth stop, this one familiar lookin' lady got onto the bus and sat down in the middle section.

By the next stop, the white section was filled up. I sat down counting up my money I had earned that day. *About twenty-four dollars*, I thought. I glanced back to the seating area and saw a white man standing calmly by the neutral section. I saw that there were no seats left in the white section so I glared at the colored people in the neutral section.

"Hey!" I yelled, "I need those seats so get up and move to the back!"

The both of them stood up but once the kind man and his son moved back, the woman sat back down. I was fed up. I wasn't afraid to use force as I had before. When a colored man decided he didn't want to exit the front and go to the back.

"Ey! What do ya think yer doin'?" My shout caused some people to gasp.

"If I get on at the back you'll just leave me," The man retorted calmly.

"Get off, make it easy on yerself!"

He just kept on walking and sat down. *I dreamed* I stood up, drew my gun, and pulled the trigger. In my dream, he clutched his chest briefly before falling backwards. A petrified look frozen was on his face forever.

He was dead. Served him right. I cleared my head from my daydream and returned to reality.

“What are you doing? Get up and make it easy on yerself, or I’ll call the police!”

“Do as you must. I will wait.” She retorted quietly.

“Excuse me?” I snapped.

“I said, do as you must and call the police. This kind of treatment is unacceptable, and I will not stand it any longer.” She replied a bit louder.

I glared at her. What does she mean? Us white people are the victims, having to live in the same place as those vermin. I turned around sharply, mutters of people engulfing me. *It was the law! The nerve of some people...* I jogged over to the payphone, through the dark illuminated street, and rang the police. It was raining out, it was getting steadily colder and rainier. My breath billowed up into the air in frozen clouds of white. I huffed as I jogged back to the bus to make sure that the woman wasn’t gonna try anything funny. Around 10 minutes later, an officer came onto the buss to assess the situation.

“What’s the problem here?”

“Officer, a colored woman is sitting in the white section, and she is refusin’ to move.”

“I see,” he retorted, while shaking his head slightly. “Are you going to move, Auntie?”

She just sat there in silent protest. The few seconds in which not a sound was heard felt like a thousand years. Tension hung thickly in the air as the officer breathed in.

“Well then, you’re under arrest lady.”

He put her in handcuffs and took her away. I nodded in approval. I closed my eyes and rested my chin on the steering wheel for a moment. I slowly let the air out of my lungs and noticed a majority of the people who were on the bus had left. I couldn’t wait to get home and to go to bed. I was let off my shift after the last stop and I traveled home, satisfied with my actions, but exhausted. I got home after a short drive through a light rain that had turned to a downpour as I went inside. I pulled some leftover pasta from the night before and ate it cold for dinner.

I sat at the table pondering the day. *I did the right thing. I am a nice guy. I’m not unfair.* Those ideas rolled over in my head throughout the night as I tried to sleep. I would have never guessed that from my choice and actions that day changed history. Most say for the better. I guess I agree. However, the thing that suffered most was my image; my reputation. Forever I will be known as the man who bullied some lady who wouldn’t do what she was told; I came to learn later her name was Rosa Parks. And, I am bad guy.