

*The Society for History Education, Inc.*

# THE HISTORY TEACHER

Volume 52 Number 2

February 2019

*Published by The Society for History Education, Inc.*

*The History Teacher* is published quarterly in November, February, May, and August for members of the Society for History Education. **Editor's Office:** Jane Dabel, *THT* Editor; MAIL: California State University, Long Beach; 1250 Bellflower Boulevard; Long Beach, CA 90840-1601; E-MAIL: editor@thehistoryteacher.org; PHONE: (562) 985-8759; FAX: (562) 985-5431.

**The Society for History Education (SHE)** is a non-profit organization and publisher of the journal. **Director's Office:** Elisa Herrera, SHE Director; MAIL: California State University, Long Beach; 1250 Bellflower Boulevard; Long Beach, CA 90840-1601; PHONE: (562) 985-2573; FAX: (562) 985-5431; E-MAIL: info@thehistoryteacher.org; WEB: <https://www.thehistoryteacher.org>.

**Membership/Subscription rates:** Individuals: U.S. \$38, Canada and Mexico \$45, all other locations \$55. Students and retirees: U.S. \$25, all other locations \$35. Lifetime membership: U.S. \$350, all other locations \$400. Institutional subscriptions to *The History Teacher*: U.S. \$65, Canada and Mexico \$75, all other locations \$85. All checks and money orders must be in U.S. dollars, drawn on a U.S. bank, and made payable to *Society for History Education, Inc.*

**Single and back issues:** U.S. \$15, Canada and Mexico \$20, all other locations \$25. Contents from back issues are available to browse and purchase from JSTOR at <<https://www.jstor.org/journal/historyteacher>>.

**Returned or undeliverable copies** of the journal and correspondence concerning subscriptions should be addressed to the Society for History Education at the Director's Office address above.

**Changes of address and claims/notices of non-receipt** should be sent to the SHE Director's Office. Changes of address should be made no later than the month preceding the date of the forthcoming publication to avoid interruption in delivery. Claims should be made within three months of publication of the missed issue. The Society is not responsible for copies lost because of failure to report a change of address in time for mailing.

Periodicals postage paid at Long Beach, California, and at additional mailing offices. Publication number: ISSN 0018 2745; USPS number: 957:080; LC number: 74-3356.

**Postmaster: Send change of address to Society for History Education; California State University, Long Beach; 1250 Bellflower Boulevard; Long Beach, CA 90840-1601.**

**Cover:** *Wounded Yellow Robe, Timber Yellow Robe, and Henry Standing Bear, 1883, #1 [before]*. Photograph by John N. Choate, 15 November 1883. Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center. Dickinson College Archives & Special Collections. <http://carlisleindian.dickinson.edu/images/wounded-yellow-robe-timber-yellow-robe-and-henry-standing-bear-1883-1/>.

**Back Cover:** *Wounded Yellow Robe, Timber Yellow Robe, and Henry Standing Bear, 1886 [after]*. Photograph by John N. Choate, November 1886. Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center. Dickinson College Archives & Special Collections. <http://carlisleindian.dickinson.edu/images/wounded-yellow-robe-timber-yellow-robe-and-henry-standing-bear-1886-after/>.

“Kill the Indian, and Save the Man” was the advice of Richard Henry Pratt, founder of the Carlisle Indian Industrial School. The Pennsylvania institution was widely noted as a “model school,” and similar operations sprouted throughout the growing United States from the late 1800s to early 1900s. The U.S. Bureau of Indian Affairs was an adopter of this approach, which included bringing children and teenagers—by force in many cases—to live at a centralized, official school.

Separated from parents and family, indigenous youth were expected to become “assimilated,” “civilized,” and “Americanized.” Former students have documented experiences of their tribal clothing and belongings being replaced with school uniforms, personal or traditional hairstyles being replaced with short or shaved haircuts, and native languages being replaced with English only. Original, family-given names were replaced with European names—at random, according to some accounts.

John Choate’s photographs were used in pamphlets, books, and other advertising for the Carlisle School as evidence of the program’s success. Choate presented these “before and after” photos to show the transformation from Indian to Man (or Woman, in the case of the girls and ladies programs). This was argued to be a humane solution to the “Indian Problem” because—as opposed to annihilation—boarding schools permitted indigenous populations to enter society with a useful, employable set of skills, ready to join the American workforce.

Digital Collections at Dickinson College and The New York Public Library offer students several stark compare-and-contrast views, with opportunities to unpack primary sources for more information. Will students notice the backdrops, furnishings, and flooring across the Choate photos, indicating they are literally staged? Will students notice the lighting adjustments from photo to photo, and wonder what features are emphasized or lost as a result? Will students reach for their phones and click on accounts that claim Choate had costumes in his studio?

We hope you and your students enjoy the learning possibilities presented in this edition of *The History Teacher*, a special-focus issue on **Indigenous and Postcolonial Perspectives**.

---

*The History Teacher* publishes articles of three general types: (1) reports on promising new classroom techniques, educational programs, curricula, and methods of evaluating instructional effectiveness; (2) analyses of important interpretations, leading historians, historiographical problems, and recent trends in specific fields of historical research; and (3) critical review essays on audiovisual materials, textbooks, and other secondary works suitable for classroom use.

*The History Teacher* also publishes reviews of audiovisual materials, books, supplementary readers, and other printed classroom materials, with evaluations of their scholarly reliability, formats, and effectiveness of presentation. Reviews are commissioned in advance. Readers interested in contributing reviews should advise the Editor of their qualifications and fields of specialization.

Submission guidelines for *The History Teacher* are available on the final page of this issue. Additional information for contributing authors is available at <<https://www.thehistoryteacher.org/contributing>>.

Correspondence regarding contributions to *The History Teacher* and materials for review should be sent to the Editor, *The History Teacher*; California State University, Long Beach; 1250 Bellflower Boulevard; Long Beach, CA 90840-1601.

The Society for History Education affirms that it does not discriminate on the basis of race, religion, national origin, age, or sex. Inquiries concerning the application of Title IX and other federal and state statutes may be referred to the Affirmative Action Officer; California State University, Long Beach; 1250 Bellflower Boulevard; Long Beach, CA 90840.

*The History Teacher* disclaims responsibility for statements, either of fact or opinion, made by contributors.

*The History Teacher* is abstracted or indexed in *Historical Abstracts*, *Education Abstracts*, *Professional Development*, *Academic Search*, *America: History and Life*, and the U.S. Dept. of Education’s *ERIC*.

---

**Editorial Board, *The History Teacher***

---

*Editor*

Jane Dabel

*Managing Editor*

Elisa Herrera

*Reviews Editors*

Jane Dabel • Tim Keirn • Eileen Luhr

*Members*Linda Alkana • Donna Binkiewicz • Gail Hamilton  
Elisa Herrera • Ali İgmen • Tim Keirn • Margaret Kuo  
Eileen Luhr • David Neumann • William A. Weber*Business, Production, and Membership Director*

Elisa Herrera

*Graduate Student Intern*Brianna P. Nelloms

---

**Board of Directors, The Society for History Education**

---

*President*

Tim Keirn

*Vice-President*

David Shafer

*Secretary*

Jane Dabel

*Treasurer*

David Shafer

*Members*Dorothy Abrahamse • Jane Dabel  
Tim Keirn • David Shafer

---

**National Advisory Board, The Society for History Education**

---

Bob Bain	<i>University of Michigan</i>
David A. Berry	<i>Essex County College</i>
Linda Black	<i>Stephen F. Austin State University</i>
Ron Briley	<i>Sandia Preparatory School</i>
Peter Burkholder	<i>Fairleigh Dickinson University</i>
Lendol Calder	<i>Augustana College</i>
Joan Catapano	<i>University of Illinois Press</i>
Ross E. Dunn	<i>San Diego State University</i>
Jodi Eastberg	<i>Alverno College</i>
Noralee Frankel	<i>Independent Scholar</i>
Lauren McArthur Harris	<i>Arizona State University</i>
Robert L. Harris	<i>Cornell University</i>
T. Mills Kelly	<i>George Mason University</i>
Michael Lovorn	<i>University of Pittsburgh</i>
Craig Perrier	<i>American Historical Association</i>
Amanda Podany	<i>California State Polytechnic Univ., Pomona</i>
Brenda Santos	<i>Achievement First</i>
Gloria Sesso	<i>Patchogue-Medford School</i>
Howard Spodek	<i>Temple University</i>
Peter N. Stearns	<i>George Mason University</i>
Merry Wiesner-Hanks	<i>University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee</i>

---

**Staff, The Society for History Education**

---

*President*

Tim Keirn

*Director*Elisa Herrera

---

**Editors of *The History Teacher***

---

2005-	Jane Dabel	1979-1984	Albie Burke
2001-2006	Nancy Quam-Wickham	1977-1979	Augustus Cerillo, Jr.
1997-2001	William Weber	1974-1977	Keith Ian Polakoff
1985-1997	Edward A. Gosselin	1972-1973	Frederic A. Youngs, Jr.
1984-1985	William F. Sater	1967-1972	Leon Bernard

# CONTENTS

*February 2019*

## THE CRAFT OF TEACHING

### Indigenous and Postcolonial Voices

- 191 *Problematizing the Past: An Overview of Teaching the History of Science in Latin America in the Anglophone Classroom and Its Major Issues*  
by Hadley Sinclair Cluxton and René Harder Horst
- 237 *Mesoamerican Perspectives on Mexican Conquest History: Using Digitized Indigenous Primary Sources in the Undergraduate Classroom*  
by Doris Namala
- 265 *Native Ecologies: Environmental Lessons from Indigenous Histories*  
by Gregory D. Smithers
- 291 *To Challenge the Settler Colonial Narrative of Native Americans in Social Studies Curriculum: A New Way Forward for Teachers*  
by Justin Krueger

## NOTES AND COMMENTS

- 319 *Finding a Time and Place for the Haitian Revolution*  
by Erica Johnson
- 333 *Integrating Foreign Language Learning into the History Classroom*  
by Luke Clossey and Vlad Vintila

### **IN EVERY ISSUE**

- 188 Contributors to *The History Teacher*
- 356 The History of *The History Teacher*
- 357 Questionnaire for Potential Reviewers
- 358 Membership/Subscription Information
- 360 Submission Guidelines for *The History Teacher*

### **ADVERTISERS IN THIS ISSUE**

- 236 Society for History Education: *Celebrating 50 Years*
- 332 Association for Asian Studies: *Discover Asia*

# CONTRIBUTORS

*February 2019*

**Luke Clossey** (Ph.D., University of California, Berkeley) teaches world history in the Department of History at Simon Fraser University. His research interests include early-modern world history, with a focus on religion and globalization. Clossey has contributed to various books and journals, and is author of *Salvation and Globalization in the Early Jesuit Missions* (Cambridge, 2008).

**Hadley Sinclair Cluxton** is a graduate student finishing a Master's Degree in History at Appalachian State University, with a dual focus on the History of Science and Technology and Latin American History.

**René Harder Horst** earned his Ph.D. from Indiana University in 1998, and has been a Professor at Appalachian State University since 2000. He is author of the forthcoming *A History of Indigenous Latin America: Araucanians to Zapatistas* (Routledge, 2019). His academic pursuits include Latin American history, Native American history, and Religious Studies.

**Erica Johnson** specializes in French Revolutionary history and the French Atlantic world. She is author of a monograph, *Philanthropy and Race in the Haitian Revolution*, part of the Cambridge Imperial and Post-Colonial Studies Series (Palgrave Macmillan, 2018). She is also co-editor (with Brian A. Banks) of *The French Revolution and Religion in Global Perspective: Freedom and Faith* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2017).

**Justin Krueger** (M.Ed., Sul Ross State University) is currently a doctoral student at The University of Texas at Austin in the Department of Curriculum and Instruction, with a focus in Social Studies Education. His research interests include collective memory, museums, public pedagogy, and learning in informal spaces.

**Doris Namala** received her Ph.D. in Colonial Latin American History at the University of California, Los Angeles in 2002. Since 2009, she has been a lecturer at California State University, Dominguez Hills, where she teaches courses on Mexican, Latin American, California, and U.S. history, as well as historical theory and methods.

**Gregory D. Smithers** is an Associate Professor of History at Virginia Commonwealth University. He is the author of numerous books and articles about indigenous history, including *The Cherokee Diaspora: An Indigenous*

*History of Migration, Resettlement, and Identity* (Yale University Press, 2015) and the forthcoming *Native Southerners: Indigenous History from Origins to Removal* (University of Oklahoma Press, 2019).

**Vlad Vintila** (Ph.D., Columbia University) teaches humanities and language in the Department of French and Department of History at Simon Fraser University. He previously taught Italian at Temple University, and also taught at Columbia University and the University of Virginia.



**Source 1 (left):** Benjamin Thomas, Mary Perry, and John Menaul, 1880 [before]. "Benjamin Thomas (Wat-ye-eh), Mary Perry (Ki-ot-se), and John Menaul (Kowsh-te-ah), at their arrival and in native dress, Pueblo Indians from Laguna, New Mexico." <<http://carlisleindian.dickinson.edu/images/benjamin-thomas-mary-perry-and-john-menaul-1880>>.

**Source 2 (right):** Benjamin Thomas, Mary Perry, and John Menaul, c. 1883 [after]. "Benjamin Thomas (Wat-ye-eh), Mary Perry (Ki-ot-se), and John Menaul (Kowsh-te-ah), Pueblo Indians from Laguna, New Mexico, in their school uniforms." <<http://carlisleindian.dickinson.edu/images/benjamin-thomas-mary-perry-and-john-menaul-c-1883-after>>.

**Source:** Tom Torlino, 1882 and 1885. "This caption reads: 'Tom Torlino—Navajo. As he entered the school in 1882. As he appeared three years later.' This image appears in John N. Choate's *Souvenir of the Carlisle Indian School* (Carlisle, PA: J. N. Choate, 1902)." <<http://carlisleindian.dickinson.edu/images/tom-torlino-1882-and-1885>>.



**Source 1 (left):** Four Pueblo Children from Zuni, New Mexico, c. 1880. "The printed caption on the reverse side reads: 'No 20. Teai-e-se-u-lu-ti-wa - Frank Cushing. Tra-wa-ea-tsa-lun-kia - Saylor [Taylor] Ealy. Tsai au-tit-sa - Mary Ealy. Jan-i-uh-tit sa - Jennie Hammaker. - Pueblos.'" <<http://carlisleindian.dickinson.edu/images/four-pueblo-children-zuni-new-mexico-c1880>>.

**Source 2 (right):** Frank Cushing, Taylor Ealy, Mary Ealy, and Jennie Hammaker [version 1], c. 1880. "Studio portrait of Frank Cushing (standing at left), Taylor Ealy (standing at right), Mary Ealy (seated in swing at left), and Jennie Hammaker (seated at right), all wearing school uniforms." <<http://carlisleindian.dickinson.edu/images/frank-cushing-taylor-ealy-mary-ealy-and-jennie-hammaker-version-1-c1880>>.

**Note:** Photographs by John N. Choate, Carlisle, PA. Images available via the Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center, Dickinson College Archives & Special Collections, <<http://carlisleindian.dickinson.edu/images>>.